WAS GILMOUR DOBIE REALLY “GLOOMY?”

By Lynn Borland

“Hustlin” Hugh Mc Elhenny, Leroy “Crazy Legs” Hirsch, Lou “The Toe” Groza, “Gloomy” Gus Henderson and “Gloomy” Gil Dobie. Sports fans love nicknames for their heroes and any reporter worth his salt knows that readership goes up when he can come up with a grabber. The alliterative charm of Gloomy appended to Gilmour proved downright irresistible back in the days when newspapers ruled the world of sports reporting. Never mind that Gil Dobie in reality was not gloomy! Despite the fact that this sobriquet has stuck like glue to the great coach for over 100 years.

Formative Years

Robert Gilmour Dobie was born to poor Scottish immigrant parents in Minnesota in 1878 and by the age of four his mother died and at eight his father joined her in death. The only alternative for his indigent stepmother was to petition the court to have young Gilmour and his brother George admitted to an orphanage. This was a life-altering chapter in his life that he never publicly revealed for as long as he lived. He was ashamed of being a ward of the state and would make up alternate childhood scenarios to interviewers when questioned later in life. Strict discipline, obedience to hard work and eleven months of schooling per year was his life while at the orphanage. It was here that he learned the authoritarian brand of leadership that he came to be known for as a coach. It was a common practice of that day to indenture
orphans out to farm families as contracted farm laborers that was supposed to last until the child was twenty-one years of age. However, Dobie had to work terribly long hours in back braking labor and was treated poorly by three successive families. He ran away from the third home and eventually was rescued by a kind hearted woman who took him in and did so well in raising the child that he was declared self-supporting by age seventeen. But Dobie’s schooling had suffered for these nine bleak years and he didn’t graduate from high school until he was twenty-one.

**Professional Career**

Spectacular success followed Dobie in everything he did in his professional life. He graduated with a law degree from the University of Minnesota in 1904. He played end for one year and quarterback for two leading the team in 1900 as captain to its first Western Conference (later the Big-10) Championship. That year he made the All-Western first team and received honorable mention on the Walter Camp Foundation All-American team. His coach, Dr. Henry L. Williams said of him “Dobie was one of the most brilliant and reliable quarters that I have ever seen” and described him as a “man of great character.” At Minnesota he also served for two years as an assistant coach while also coaching the Minneapolis South High School football team. He led them to two undefeated seasons, winning the state championship in 1903.

As head coach at North Dakota State he went undefeated for 1906, ’07, his two years there. Being over six feet tall, 28 years old and only weighing 175 pounds his players wanted to assert their manhood by challenging him. Playing right into Dobie’s hands this gave him the chance to establish himself as boss in the only way he knew – settle it with his fists. Pulling off his coat and sweater and from the middle of the field dared every player to fight him one-on-one. There were no takers! As an eight year old orphan he had learned that one must fight for everything you get in this world. A lesson that left an indelible mark on his life and goes a long way in explaining his drill sergeant coaching philosophy.

He next coached at the University of Washington for the years 1908 to 1916 – a dynamic period that saw the college game mature from one of brute force to a more sophisticated contest requiring speed and tactical skill. This was brought about by the rules changes of 1910, ’12 and ’14. Dobie was famous for his off
tackle line buck because he drilled his players until they pulled it off with machine-like efficiency but he readily adapted to the evolving open style of play and his teams soon gained skill in passing. Many in those days resisted the pass as “not real football” but Dobie recognized its advantages and took to it early. Shockingly after registering nine undefeated seasons with a record of 59-0-3 Dobie was fired. This streak combined with the last game of 1907 before Dobie arrived and the first game of 1917 after he left make up the NCAA record for undefeated games that is still on the books. He was fired because of a players’ strike just before the big Thanksgiving game against the University of California. President Suzzallo had promised the seven football players who had been called up for National Guard duty extra time for completing finals because of having to juggle military exercises, class schedules, study time and football practice. But he left town on business for two months during the football season and never put the policy into effect. A star player, feeling the pressure in a moment of weakness cheated on a history test and when found out was suspended for the Cal game. The players went on strike feeling that a suspension was called for but it should go into effect after the Big Game with the penalty enforced next season. Dobie did not have a hand in calling the strike and out of team loyalty didn’t encourage the players to break the strike. For this he was fired and a huge protest movement of students erupted.

From Washington Dobie went on to even greater accomplishment back east. He coached at Navy where after thirteen years of never losing a game the football world was set on its ear with the shocking news that the great coach had lost a game to West Virginia 7-0. But he immediately went back to business, winning the next six games, four of which were shutouts. He would coach at Navy for the three seasons of 1917, ‘18 and ’19 with a record of 18-3. Football in those years was seriously impacted by World War I.

Due to the streak which was further boosted by his colorful personality, gruff manor, accusation of being a pessimist and his unrestrained tongue when a reporter needed a juicy headline – Dobie became a darling of the press. It was at Washington that the claim of eternal pessimist stuck and has held fast ever since. But this didn’t cut any ice with Cornell who went after Dobie now alternately termed a miracle worker, wizard and by the New York Times a football genius. Hitting the ground running in usual fashion, he won his first five games for 1920 and finished with a respectable 6-2. For 1921, ’22, ’23 he went undefeated and garnered the national championship for the years 1921, and ’22 (loyal Cornelians will claim 1923 as well). During the 1920s, because of the increasing complexity of the game, a trend developed in many schools to
deemphasize athleticism over scholarship. Cornell being one of the schools to require higher academic standards for all students placed the football team at a disadvantage. This is when the Big Red’s football fortunes under Coach Dobie began to decline. He ended his term at Cornell following the 1935 season with an overall record of 82-36-7.

He immediately took his final coaching assignment at Boston College at a time that Dobie was continuing to decry the increasing complexity of the game. He had always been an advocate of fewer plays and with his methodical training methods his strategy was to wear down the opposition with superior execution. But this approach only worked if all teams were recruiting from the same player pool with uniform academic standards. This was not to be. Dobie’s record for his final three years was 1936: 6-1-2, 1937: 4-4-1 and 1938: 6-1-2 for an overall total of 16-6-5. His thirty-three year college record ranks him in the upper echelon at 183-45-15 for a lifetime winning percentage of .784.

**Pessimism and Gloom**

Gilmour Dobie is a member of the Hall of Fame at every university where he either played or coached, is in the HOF of the states of Washington and Minnesota, is a member of the inaugural class (1951) of the National Football Foundation and Hall of Fame, third president of the National Football Coaches Association (1926), and received the Amos Alonzo Stagg Award for Outstanding Achievement for a Football Coach. Sports fans love a winner and Dobie was no exception. During his coaching days the fans adored him with a passion bordering on worship. What self-respecting fan wouldn’t show devotion for a coach who could post sixteen undefeated seasons? At Washington, even the school’s fight song written during his time included the chorus “Dobie, Dobie Pride of Washington.” Countless newspaper reporters wrote stories of his positive aspects of good sportsmanship, intelligence, wit and personality. His friends who were interviewed spoke of his great sense of humor, his fun to be around over a beer and a cigar, his loyalty, his devotion to family and his good character.

So what is there to this claim that he was gloomy? At the very heart of this question we need look no further than four critical facets of his life: his childhood as an orphan, his perfectionist nature, his ability at psychological manipulation and his morbid fear that his players would develop an inflated ego.
It was during his years as a destitute orphan that Dobie developed his fighting spirit, tough guy demeanor and demanding nature that, as an adult, evolved into his obsessive coaching style. His orphanage years of deprivation could have broken a weaker person. But in Dobie’s case it served to invest in him an indomitable will to succeed. Law school training requires an attention to detail and it can be seen that his meticulous focus on minute detail went well beyond the normal. He demanded perfection from his players and would spend an entire practice perfecting a single play. His players hated the endless repetition but were the first to applaud the master for getting them game ready – winning makes up for the misery of practice in any player’s mind.

It is the area of psychological manipulation that has gotten the greatest attention over the decades when writers have attempted to put their finger on just why Dobie was so successful, despite his often quirky and constantly demanding nature. They didn’t have the advantage of knowing his orphanage upbringing so they were essentially flying blind. Many times they would mistakenly conclude that Dobie’s hard side derived from some deep seated negativity and dismiss him as hopelessly gloomy; overlooking the fact that he was declared to be a man of warmth and character by those who knew him personally.

The record shows he was branded as Gloomy Gil at Washington and it is there that we find just how he came to be forever labeled a pessimist. But Mr. Gloom put one over on the sports writers of his day! A careful game-by-game analysis of every one of Dobie’s games during his nine year streak reflects a stunningly consistent pattern. In every game against a weak opponent that looks to be an easy win for Washington, Dobie predicts a loss. In those games where he’s up against a strong opponent and the advance reports all predict disaster, he clams up, goes wishy-washy or even sticks his neck out and sees a chance for a win. With all the papers carrying his water for him Dobie doesn’t have to do the obvious go along with the crowd. No need for overkill. Everyone else is signaling to his team exactly what needs to be done, deflate their pumped up egos that have overheated from constant winning. So it turns out that Dobie is not Gloomy after all. A master of psychology yes, but in reality he is a contrarian. He goes against the grain all because he must keep his player’s egos in check, no matter that it comes at the price of him going down in history as Gloomy Gil.

“After all football is mostly psychology.” Gilmour Dobie, 1908

*The College Football Historian-*
The book is available online at Amazon both in print or Kindle. The print version is $18.95 the Kindle version is $8.95.

*          *          *

Source: Outing, 1903

MIDDLE WESTERN FOOTBALL

By F. H. YOST
Coach of Michigan’s Champion Eleven

The football season in the Middle West was not only marked by the greatest general interest ever shown in the game in that section of the country, but the championship was settled in the most conclusive manner. Michigan and Wisconsin, both of whom claimed first honors in the season of 1901, were able this year to settle their disputes by something more definite than comparative scores; in consequence there are no post-season claimants to the championship.

An important factor in creating interest in football has been the system of interscholastic teams in vogue in Michigan, Ohio, and other states. These contests have been of great value in educating the masses of the people in the fine points of the game, and preparatory and high schools are availing themselves of the aid of experienced coaches, whose aim is to impart to the young players the very latest and most effective methods. As a result, the high schools and smaller colleges have become good feeders to the universities, and the standard is raised accordingly.

The union of the nine leading universities into the “Big Nine” conference has also had a very noticeable influence on the standard of athletics.

This organization has exerted a very powerful and wholesome effect, not merely upon its members, but also upon outside colleges and universities; football interests have been materially helped and advanced by means of the rules and regulations which it enforces.

All of the large western teams have a very competent coaching force made up of former stars of Yale, Harvard, Princeton, and Pennsylvania. With a wealth of

The College Football Historian-7-
football material in the shape of big, strong, healthy men, many of them versed in the fine points of the game, the western coaches have a fine foundation upon which to build. The snap and fire which is inbred in the character of the average westerner, has much to do with the team’s success.

As to the comparative strength, Michigan, no doubt, is easily the leader. Although it had the most difficult schedule of any team in the West, it went through the entire season successfully, and gained the western championship by defeating Minnesota on Thanksgiving Day.

Some idea of the task Michigan had to contend with, may be gained from a comparison of its schedule with those of Harvard and Yale. Michigan had to keep all her players in first-class condition from the latter part of October until Thanksgiving, for the three hard games against Chicago, Wisconsin, and Minnesota; while Yale trained her players for the Princeton and Harvard games, and Harvard for the Pennsylvania and Yale games. Michigan has become noted for the versatility of her plays, as compared with those of the other western universities. The Illinois team relied upon the old Princeton style of play, varied occasionally by the tackle-back; Chicago upon her whole-back formation; Minnesota upon a back field shift with the tackle-back, and a double tandem; and Wisconsin upon the Princeton style of play. Michigan was noted for team work of the highest order, while its fast play and varied style of attack made it a difficult aggregation to oppose. Line plays have been the feature of one game, place kicking of another, and end runs of still another.

Captain Weeks is largely responsible for the exceptionally fine work of the team. As a leader of forces and a strategist I believe he has no equal on the gridiron to-day. His generalship throughout the whole season was superb; he has the ability to get the most work out of every man and use it at the right time and place. He is a most remarkable player in every way, and there never has been a time in two seasons when his resourceful mind was unable to pull his team out of a tight place.

The criticism of the western teams would show that Minnesota has played a strong and consistent game. Its team is composed of strong and aggressive players who fought to the very end. They were defeated in an early game by Nebraska, six to nothing, but improved rapidly up to the last game. On November 8th they defeated Illinois at Minneapolis, seventeen to five, and on

*The College Football Historian.*
November 15th defeated Wisconsin eleven to nothing; and they lost the Thanksgiving game to Michigan twenty-three to six.

Wisconsin is noted for the first-class teams which it always turns out; this year has shown no exception to the past. They have been rather unfortunate in the way of accidents to their star players. Captain Juneau was injured in the Michigan game November 1st, and was unable to play.

Chicago produced a team that, throughout the whole season, did not cease to improve and perfect its work, from the beginning of the schedule to Thanksgiving Day, when it played its best game against Wisconsin, winning by eleven to nothing. The team lost but one game, to Michigan, November, 15th, twenty-one to nothing.

Illinois played exceptionally good ball at times, and not so well at others. Chicago's score against it was six to nothing.

Nebraska this year showed great strength, defeating Minnesota and winning the championship of the Missouri Valley. Its team defeated Kansas sixteen to nothing and Missouri twelve to nothing.

Michigan's strength this year can best be shown by the total score for the season, which was 644 points to its opponents' twelve or an average of over a point for every minute of play. Michigan's record for the two seasons of 1901 and 1902 is 1,194 points, as against twelve for her opponents, in twenty-two games.

As to the future of football in the Middle West, I believe that the standard of excellence will increase each year, and that no one team or several teams will stand in a class by themselves, as the large universities are getting their equal share of experienced high school and collegiate players, who have had the benefit of good coaching; the tendency will be one of equality. The increased interest everywhere manifested in the game will result in a higher standard for the sport generally.

The East will need to look to her laurels, for no longer do the leading western teams consider themselves inferior in any way, to the best eleven the East can produce.

* * * *

* * * *
Monsters of the Midway...a book by Jeff Rasley

Was this ragtag band of precocious intellectuals the worst, or the most courageous, team in college football? From 1892 until the 1930s the legendary Monsters of the Midway dominated college football. The University of Chicago team was coached by the most successful coach in college football, Amos Alonzo Stagg. However, in 1929 Robert Maynard Hutchins, who viewed athletics and especially football as a waste of resources, became president of U of C. He forced Stagg out after the 1932 season. In 1939, at Hutchins urging, Chicago dropped out of the Big Ten and killed its varsity football program.

But now, it's 1969 and football is back. The resurrection of Chicago football hasn't brought the Monsters back to life. The team plays more like the lab mice of the Midway.

The new Maroons are called "the worst team in college ball" by People Magazine. But this under-sized and outnumbered team is also compared to the hero of Troy courageously facing Achilles. They lose game after game. Yet, guys whose IQ is greater than their weight refuse to give up their mission to win one for their old coach, Wally Hass. Wally's goal is to win one more game before he retires which would make his 100th victory as a coach.

Sex, drugs, rock and roll, the Draft Lottery, the Anti-War Movement and student rebellion—the cultural revolution on college campuses in the late 60s—is experienced by the team's wide receiver. Jack Blair is a small town Hoosier kid who just wanted to go to the best college in the Midwest. In Chicago Jack encounters figures as disparate as Muhammad Ali, Milton Friedman and George Halas.

Jack joins the team for resume-building. His goal is to win the Rhodes scholarship and maybe also a football game. Along with his teammates he is swept into the tumult of the late 1960s. He falls in love with a radical feminist who demonstrates against the return of football to Chicago. He rooms with a
secular Jewish kid taking ballet whose father has begun manufacturing something called a computer chip.

Jack's teammates reflect the wackiness of the times. There is the 135 pound nose guard and the 295 pound Sumerian scholar. On the team bus the Maroons blast The Mothers of Invention on an 8-track, smoke pot and worry about a friend's suicide attempt.

An assistant coach rides Jack for not fully committing to the team. His favorite professor chides him to concentrate on his studies. What sustains Jack through the bewildering cultural milieu, and the pressure of balancing sports and studies, is the tolerant understanding of his head coach and the friendship of his teammates.

The book is inspired by the author's experience of playing on the resurrected University of Chicago Maroons a/k/a the Monsters of the Midway. Jeff Rasley is also the author of five other books, *Bringing Progress to Paradise, Light in the Mountains, False Prophet?, Islands in my Dreams* and *Nepal Himalayas in the Moment*.

*          *          *

**IFRA Remembers**

* < Obituaries >

Donald J. Houde, age 79, *Boston University*…  
Val J. Mannens, age 72 *Mason City Junior College* where he was an All-American quarterback in 1959… *Harry Dean Bishop, Furman University*. He was 79… *Jimmie L Marlett, New Mexico State College (University)*; he was 93… *Ray Easterling, Richmond*; he was 62… *Major George J. Policano, USMC (Ret.), Alfred University*; he was 80… *Col. John G. Ballard, Jr. USAF (Ret.), West Point*; he was 84… *John E. "Jack" or "Jocko" Thompson, Moravian College*. He was 86 years old… *Cody Fanning, Doane College*; he was 20… *John F. "Jack" Pearl* (recipient of the Bronze Star in WW II); he was 91. Former *Ole Miss* player and athletics director **Roland Dale** passed away Sunday, April 22. He was 84. . . Former *North Carolina Central* head coach **LeRoy T. Walker** passed away Monday, April 23. He was 93… *Charles Weldon Murdock*, retired Athletic Director at Central Oklahoma; he was 81… *Allen "Al" Joseph Ecuyer*, age 74, co-captain of the 1958 Notre Dame team. He was a three-year starter for Notre Dame at guard, first team All-American in 1957… *Ralph E. Hartnagel, Jr.*, *Southeast Missouri State*. He was 66. His 1955 football team was inducted into SEMO State Athletic Hall of Fame in 2003… *Major George J. Policano, USMC (Ret.)*, *Alfred University*; he was 80… *Col. John G. Ballard, Jr. USAF (Ret.), West Point*; he was 84… *John E. "Jack" or "Jocko" Thompson, Moravian College*. He was 86 years old… *Cody Fanning, Doane College*; he was 20… *John F. "Jack" Pearl* (recipient of the Bronze Star in WW II); he was 91. Former *Ole Miss* player and athletics director **Roland Dale** passed away Sunday, April 22. He was 84. . . Former *North Carolina Central* head coach **LeRoy T. Walker** passed away Monday, April 23. He was 93… *Charles Weldon Murdock*, retired Athletic Director at Central Oklahoma; he was 81… *Allen "Al" Joseph Ecuyer*, age 74, co-captain of the 1958 Notre Dame team. He was a three-year starter for Notre Dame at guard, first team All-American in 1957… *Ralph E. Hartnagel, Jr.*, *Southeast Missouri State*. He was 66. His 1955 football team was inducted into SEMO State Athletic Hall of Fame in 2003… *Junior Seau, USC*; he was 43… *Andy Paul Samosiuk,*

**The College Football Historian-11-**
Dick Beam, an assistant on two of Southern California's national championship football teams (he also played at Whittier College). He was 75.

George "Gobber" Lindsey, Florence State Teachers College (now the University of North Alabama) [where he played quarterback]. He was 83.

Louisiana Tech, he was 81.

former Michigan State center Rich Saul; he was 64.

Raymond Jerome Hill, Jacksonville State; he was 89.

Alan M. Hansen, Worcester Polytechnic Institute; he was 86.

George Theodore "Ted" Parker, 88; Elon College…Robert P. Berryman, 87, Stanford.

Texas games on radio from 1959-1994 and taught broadcasting at the school for more than 30 years…Ohio State SID, Shelly Poe, has won the organization’s 2012 Trailblazer Award.

Vince Dooley has received the Duffy Daugherty Memorial Award…Auburn unveiled statues of its Heisman Trophy winners, including Cam Newton and Bo Jackson and Pat Sullivan…North Texas has christened a meeting room at Apogee Stadium as the Bill Mercer Press Club. Mercer called North Texas games on radio from 1959-1994 and taught broadcasting at the school for more than 30 years…Ohio State SID, Shelly Poe, has won the organization’s 2012 Trailblazer Award.

Kevin Thomas and the 1984 California Bowl championship team were selected to the UNLV Athletic Hall of Fame…Darrell Green, Texas A&I, inducted into the D.C. Sports Hall of Fame…Former Texas-Arlington athletics director Pete Carlin and former McNeese State football player Kerry Joseph, into the Southland Conference's Hall of Honor… Former Eastern Illinois head football coach Bob Spoo has been elected into the Ohio Valley Conference Hall of Fame…Herb Deromedi, Central Michigan, Mid-American Conference (MAC) Hall of Fame…USC Hall of Fame Tony Boselli, Adrian Young, Keyshawn Johnson, Clarence Davis…John Arnaudon, Saint Mary's College…Walter Abbott, Maine.

Former Army football player Don Holleder, who lost his life during the Vietnam War, was honored with Distinguished Service Cross, the U.S. Army's second-highest combat award…Joe Paterno, who coached Penn State to 409 wins from 1966 to 2011, will be posthumously honored with the 2012 Dick Enberg Award, and is presented by the College Sports Information Directors of America. The award goes to those who are passionate and committed to academics and athletics.

The Football Writers Association of America has announced its third "Super 11" field of sports information departments which were deemed the best in the NCAA Football Bowl Subdivision during the 2011 season.

Auburn, Georgia, Georgia Tech, Michigan State, Northern Illinois, Oklahoma, San Diego State, Southern California, Syracuse, Utah State and Western Kentucky are the winners. For a third straight season, Georgia and USC have been chosen for the elite group of sports information departments, as well as the only repeaters from 2010.

*          *          *

The College Football Historian-12-
The Gridiron Crisis of 1905: Was It Really A Crisis?

By John Sayle Watterson

In 1944, Frank Menke’s Encyclopedia of Sports presented one of the most memorable stories in sport history. In his chapter on football, Menke would assert that President Theodore Roosevelt threatened to shut down college football in the fall of 1905. Teddy Roosevelt was shocked, he declared, when he saw a newspaper photo of Swarthmore football player, Bob Maxwell, with his face bloodied in a brutal game with Penn.

Of course, today we are used to TV commentators spinning their own version of events, and many regard the scenarios and depictions of JFK, Knute Rockne, and Babe Ruth as highly questionable. But for dictionaries and encyclopedias, scholars and the public expect a higher standard. And when these works play fast and loose with the truth as in Menke’s Encyclopedia, they do far more damage than do newspapers, magazines, or movies. The Maxwell myth, or more accurately the injury crisis of 1905, is an example of how combining truth and fiction can create a powerful story line, even though it is palpably false.

Where did the story go wrong? As Menke’s encyclopedia asserted, Roosevelt did play a leading role in that turbulent season. Two days after Maxwell’s injury, the president held a White House Conference attended by delegates from Harvard, Yale, and Princeton. Unfortunately for a good story, the president had called the meeting several weeks before the fierce encounter between Penn and Swarthmore. Even if Roosevelt had seen the bloody face of Tiny Maxwell, Swarthmore’s refrigerator-sized guard, he said nothing about it to the six pigskin potentates; at least, he left no record of it. And even if he had wanted to do so, he could not have shut down football, except at West Point and Annapolis.¹

And what of the deaths and injuries that Menke attributed to college football? Here the encyclopedia got the story partially right. By the end of the 1905 season, a crisis had erupted over gridiron deaths and injuries. On December 3, for example, the Cincinnati Commercial Tribune showed an image of the grim reaper balanced on the crossbars dramatizing the “ghastly total of 25 killed and 168 injured in football.”²

For the next two months, the foes of football debated whether to suspend football or just deemphasize it. These debates brought about benchmark rules changes. The ten-yard rule, the neutral zone, stricter measures against unfair play, and most importantly the forward pass all emerged from these debates. Menke and his contributors naturally spotlighted these changes. In so doing, however, they left readers with the impression that college football had in a historical microsecond

¹The College Football Historian-13-
overcome its crude and violent past—and that Theodore Roosevelt, prompted by Bob Maxwell, was responsible.³

Let us suppose that the editors of the *Encyclopedia* put the cart before the horse, or, for the sake of drama, overlooked the facts of the crisis. A former sports reporter like Menke could have known the colorful Tiny Maxwell, for Maxwell had become a sportswriter in Chicago and Philadelphia. Conceivably Menke recalled the genial giant’s account of his rendezvous with destiny. Or possibly, the members of the Maxwell Club, founded in 1937 and made up of sportswriters and college athletic officials, contributed to the chapter. Is it not possible that they would overlook or ignore the fact that only three college players were killed out of eighteen? Or that the most important injuries came near the end of the season six weeks after the president had hosted the six football experts from Harvard, Yale, and Princeton?⁴

In truth, the key injury in 1905 occurred, not in Philadelphia but in New York—and it involved lesser-known players and teams. New York University was playing Union College on November 21 in Manhattan. NYU was moving the ball by mass plays and tandem formations. That meant they were going in motion before the start of the play and were pushing and pulling the ball carrier toward the goal. Harold Moore, Union’s right halfback, who was desperate to halt NYU’s potent offense, tried to tackle the ball carrier around the shoulders. His unprotected head probably struck the knee of another Union player who had jumped into the gaggle of bodies. When Moore failed to get to his feet, a Union alumnus offered the use of his car and with the team doctor took Moore to the Fordham University hospital, less than ten minutes away. Given the lack of cat scans and other modern technology, Moore had little chance of surviving. He died of a cerebral hemorrhage at 6:40 PM.⁵

Chancellor Henry MacCracken of NYU immediately telegraphed President Charles Eliot of Harvard, football’s most relentless critic. He asked him to call a caucus of colleges to reform the rules. Neither MacCracken nor Eliot trusted the old rules committee, for it was dominated by Walter Camp of Yale and other alumni advisors and coaches from big-time eastern colleges. But Eliot refused to preside over reform of the rules. He believed that football itself was the problem and the game was beyond repair. Instead, MacCracken and the NYU faculty called their own conference to meet in early December. That first New York conference led to a second, larger meeting later in December that became the forerunner of the NCAA.⁶

In December, presidents and faculty in all parts of the country got into the act. So did coaches and athletic advisors. Though deaths and injuries provided the impetus, these reformers had many agendas piggybacked on the gridiron crisis. Harvard’s Bill Reid had in October formed an alumni committee to draw up rules changes. In his diary,
Reid recorded that he was worried about President Eliot’s perennial distaste for football as well as opposition by various faculties. He had also learned that Harvard’s arch enemy Walter Camp, the Yale football potentate, planned to introduce his own reforms. In order to beat Camp and head off Eliot, Reid kept the old committee from holding a meeting to consider rules changes. When he began his own rules crusade, Reid showed little genuine interest in reform. Most of all, he seems to have wanted new “Harvard” rules that would enable him to beat Yale.

In New York, President Nicolas Murray Butler of Columbia abolished football immediately after the end of the season. The ax fell while the students were at home for the Thanksgiving break. Calling football an “academic nuisance,” Butler refused to budge—in spite of student rallies, alumni protests, and the distinct possibility of reforms in the rules. In a speech given in December, his counterpart at NYU, Chancellor MacCracken, likened the old football committee to the “grand dukes” of Czarist Russia; he charged that they had resisted the attempts of reformers and even the President of the United States to clean up the game. Newspapers reprinted the statement of the dean of the divinity school at the University of Chicago, who called football “a social obsession—a boy-killing, education-prostituting, gladiatorial sport.” No wonder the pro-football Professor Edmund Dexter of Illinois, whose earlier surveys claimed to show that deaths and injuries were all but negligible, termed the 1905 outburst “newspaper football.”

In the Midwest, protest also erupted. At the University of Chicago, the faculty openly defined their ailing president, William Harper, as well as domineering coach and Director of Physical Culture Amos Alonzo Stagg. They refused to allow students to play football unless “the moral and physical evils” were remedied. At Wisconsin, a committee pilloried the faculty representatives of the Western Conference (Big Nine, later Big Ten) for doing so little to reform the college game. And the leader of football opposition at Wisconsin, historian Frederick Jackson Turner, prevailed on President James Angell of Michigan to hold a reform conference in Chicago early in January 1906. In a nutshell, Turner and a few of his allies hoped to persuade the faculty delegates to suspend football for a period of two years.

On the West Coast, the presidents of the two big-time football schools—David Starr Jordan of Stanford and Benjamin Wheeler of California—seized the opportunity to sever their ties with the eastern football cartel. At the last moment, Jordan called off the trip of political scientist Max Farrand, who was about to set off for the second
conference in New York. Both Jordan and Wheeler believed that their own gridiron rivalry had become too intense, occupying the attention of students for months and overshadowing the academic mission of their universities. Eventually the two institutions, the eight-hundred pound gorillas of coastal athletics, replaced football with rugby. Put simply, the problem of injuries and deaths merely provided the springboard for this change. Neither school had suffered a death nor serious injury; rugby would surely not prove a sedate substitute. Yet their changes would endure for more than a decade.

That death and injuries do not explain the opposition becomes clearer when we examine the years that followed the “crisis” of 1905 (see Table I). After reforms in 1906, the number of overall fatalities dropped significantly. In spite of the reduction in deaths at all levels, the number of casualties in the college game remained at three. Curiously, those three deaths occurring at obscure colleges failed to cause a murmur. But in 1908

| Table I: Deaths and Serious Injuries, 1905-1916 |
|---------|-----------|-----------|-----------|
|         | All Levels| All Levels| All Levels| College |
| 1905    | 18        | 3         | 159       | 88      |
| 1906    | 11        | 3         | 104       | 54      |
| 1907    | 11        | 2         | 98        | 51      |
| 1908    | 13        | 6         | 84        | 33      |
| 1909    | 26        | 10        | 69        | 38      |
| 1910    | 14        | 5         | 40        | 17      |
| 1911    | 14        | 3         | 356       | 36      |
| 1912    | 10*       | 0*        | 26        | 17      |
| 1913    | 14        | 3         | 56        | 36      |
| 1914    | 12        | 2         | na        | na      |
| 1915    | na        | na        | na        | na      |
| 1916    | 16        | 3         | na        | na      |

Figures from New York Times and Chicago Tribune and 1909, the number of college casualties suddenly shot up to eight and then to ten. On October 31, 1909, an Army
cadet, Eugene Byrne, died from a concussion following a game against Harvard at West Point. Occurring near Manhattan, the nation’s newspaper capital, Byrne’s death abruptly reawakened public concern. Two weeks later, a University of Virginia halfback, Archer Christian, also died from a concussion sustained in a game at Georgetown. As a result, school systems in Washington, D.C., St. Louis, and New York suspended football, and Georgetown abolished the game. Virginia and North Carolina called off their annual Thanksgiving rivalry.¹¹

Unlike the crisis of 1905, the criticism that followed that season showed that the participants wanted mainly to solve the injury crisis and preserve the college game. At the ICAA conference in December 1909, the remaining members of the old reform committee, such as Walter Camp, were bitterly attacked. The critics were looking for scapegoats. They wanted to fix responsibility for injuries so that football could be purged of dangers left unsolved by the new rules. Conspicuously missing in 1909-10, however, were the meetings of faculty and dissident presidents intent on de-emphasizing or abolishing football. The only exceptions were the Jesuit schools led by Georgetown, and the Kansas Board of Regents, before whom newspaperman William Allen White mounted a vigorous attack on football; other than that, the injury crisis was exactly that—a crisis that was totally overlooked by the Encyclopedia of Sports and by a generation of sport historians. It did not fit into the myth of modern football’s origins spun by the Encyclopedia of Sports or by the founders of the Maxwell Society.¹²

What does this tell us about the 1905 crisis? Simply this: The varying agendas may be attributed to many factors, including the reform efforts common to the Progressive Era. In the early 1900s the country experienced one of its most intense periods of criticism and political unrest. Earnest reformers attempted to eliminate corruption and inefficiency, reintroduce democratic practices, and improve the standards of safety. Thus in 1906, Congress passed the Pure Food and Drug Act, the medical and gastronomical version of the new football rules. As in politics, college athletics had its version of muckraking journalists, who like journalists Ida Tarbell and Lincoln Steffens burrowed into the unethical activities of win-at-all-coast coaches and alumni. Newspapers exaggerated the gravity of deaths and injuries in 1905 because the lack of safety standards for unprotected groups like women and young people made for good, or at least sensational, copy.¹³

Was this crisis of 1905, then, a death and injury crisis? At the level of popular consciousness, the overall number of deaths and injuries did suggest that football had become both brutal and dangerous. Indeed, gridiron brutality such as Jim Quill’s...
assault on Francis Burr in the Harvard-Yale game made it appear that college football had spun out of control. Theodore Roosevelt’s brief intervention in football politics strengthened various groups discontented with the hand that big-time football had dealt them. The college faculties, which had lost control of athletics to students and alumni, had compelling reasons to de-emphasize football. The public outrage at deaths and injuries allowed the faculties to confine athletics, and especially football, to bona fide students in college settings under faculty-imposed requirements.

Once the faculties had enacted their reforms, however, they found less reason to piggyback on the far more serious injury (see Table I and II). As for the colleges where the presidents and reformer made the most of the 1905 hysteria—Harvard, Wisconsin, Stanford, and California—they and their faculties would play a far less prominent role, or no role at all, in the later crisis. This strongly suggests that the crisis of 1905 had served simply as a springboard for those who wanted to redirect college sports. Concern with death and injury played second fiddle.¹⁴

In popular history, the injury crisis of 1905 operated for many years much like the Abner Doubleday myth in baseball. In other words, it formed a heroic version of football’s entry into the modern world. Bob “Tiny” Maxwell, the stammering behemoth of the Swarthmore gridiron, provided the perfect metaphor for the transition from the old to the new. Here was a big-hearted giant, a small-college stalwart, an underdog bloodied by brutal opponents. Moreover, he was avenged when an American president glimpsed the bloodstains from a broken nose in a Sunday newspaper. Whereas baseball could only find a relatively obscure Civil War general, Abner Doubleday, college football had ready-made an American president and folk hero. Teddy Roosevelt, himself a sportsman writ large, descended briefly from the Olympian affairs of state to make lightning crackle with a wave of his hand. In so doing, he sent the colleges scurrying to reinvent the rules of a sullied game. Or so the myth would lead us to believe.

I fear that the upheaval of 1905 will always be associated with deaths and injuries. That association will persist because such stories form the journalistic account of football as played at all levels. How remarkable that a medical noncrisis or at most a collegiate minicrisis, could be the springboard for assaults by so many disenchanted groups. Putting it as simply as possible, college football has never seen a more remarkable season—not due so much to the deaths and injuries but rather to the way in which the facts were presented to the public. And, for that matter, to the way they were later embroidered in the Teddy Roosevelt myth invented by Frank Menke’s sports

The College Football Historian-18-
encyclopedia. As the Abner Doubleday-Cooperstown yarn has demonstrated, such archetypal myths are extremely hard to shake.

But I believe that we can now start to understand what exactly happened in that pivotal year, 1905—or, more accurately, what did not happen. Put simply, it was not a medical crisis in which a large number of college players were killed. Neither was it a crisis set off by a photo of a Swarthmore College player’s bloody face. And, finally this was not a national political crisis in which Teddy Roosevelt threatened to shut down college football.

No, the events in the fall of 1905 point to a crisis of public confidence fanned by newspaper headlines and exploited by groups that disliked the existing gridiron system.

Table II: Newspaper Reports on Causes of Deaths in College Football

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1905</th>
<th>1906</th>
<th>1907</th>
<th>1908</th>
<th>1909</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Body blows</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>22.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spinal injuries</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>17.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concussions</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blood Poisoning</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>26.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>80</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figures from New York Times and Chicago Tribune

Author’s Note: This article was first published in the Summer 2000 issue of The Journal of Sport History, pp. 291-298. Some of the material is elaborated in my books, College Football, History, Spectacle, Controversy and The Games Presidents Play, Sports and the Presidency.

Editor’s note: Foot note references are available at the end of the newsletter.
Bo Carter presents…College Football Hall of Famers: Date of Birth and Date of Death

May

1 (1900) Stan Barnes, Baraboo, Wis.
1 (1905) Chris Cagle, DeRidder, La.
1 (1907) Erby Pinckert, Medford, Wis.
1 (1910) Cliff Battles, Akron, Ohio
1 (1925) Chuck Bednarik, Bethlehem, Pa.
1 (1930) Ollie Matson, Trinity, Texas
1 (1937) Roger Brown, Surry County, Va.
1 (1950) Carlos Alvarez, Havana, Cuba
1-(d – 1982) Ed Tryon, St. Petersburg, Fla.
2 (1887) Joe Utay, St. Louis, Mo.
2 (1955) Richard Ritchie, Mineral Wells, Texas
3 (1919) Gil Steinke, Brenham, Texas
3 (1927) Bobby Davis, Columbus, Ga.
3 (1941) Dave Robinson, Mt. Holly, N.J.
3-(d – 1971) Scrappy Moore, Chattanooga, Tenn.
4 (1903) Elmer Layden, Davenport, Iowa
4 (1928) Don Coleman, Ponca City, Okla.
5 (1921) Eddie Talboom, Delphos, Ohio
5 (1927) Al DeRogatis, Newark, N.J.
5 (1941) Terry Baker, Pine River, Minn.
5 (1947) Bob Babich, Youngstown, Ohio
6 (1909) Johnny Vaught, Olney, Texas
6 (1922) Pat Harder, Milwaukee, Wis.
7 (1896) Belford West, Hamilton, N.Y.
7 (1905) Henry “Red” Sanders, Asheville, N.C.
7-(d – 1960) John Kilpatrick, New York City
8 (1930) Doug Atkins, Humboldt, Tenn.
8 (1959) Ronnie Lott, Albuquerque, N.M.
8-(d – 2006) John Kimbrough, Haskell, Texas
10 (1917) Charlie O’Rourke, Montreal, Quebec, Canada
10-(d – 1911) Gordon Brown, Glen Head, N.Y.
10-(d – 1982) Alex Weyand, North Bellmore, N.Y.
10-(d – 1995) Gil Steinke, Austin, Texas
11 (1874) Langdon Lea, Germantown, Pa.
11-(d – 1986) Fritz Pollard, Silver Spring, Md.
12 (1888) John Wilce, Rochester, N.Y.
12 (1934) Harold Davis, Youngstown, Ohio
12 (1948) Joe Cichy, Fargo, N.D.
13-(d – 1985) Morley Jennings, Lubbock, Texas
14 (1907) Howard Harpster, Salem Ore.
14 (1924) John Ferraro, Cudahy, Calif.
15 (1958) Ron Simmons, Perry, Ga.
15 (1966) Thurman Thomas, Houston, Texas
15 (1970) Desmond Howard, Cleveland, Ohio
15-(d – 1999) Bobby Wilson, Brenham, Texas
16-(d – 2006) Dan Ross, Haverhill, N.H.
17 (1912) Ace Parker, Portsmouth, Va.
17-(d – 1963) John Wilce, Westerville, Ohio
17-(d – 1993) Bill Wallace, Houston, Texas
18 (1916) Paul Hoernemann, Lima, Texas
18 (1924) Charlie “Choo Choo” Justice, Asheville, N.C.
18-(d – 1963) Ernie Davis, Cleveland, Ohio
18-(d – 1977) Nathan Dougherty, Knoxville, Tenn.
19 (1893) Tuss McLaughry, Chicago, Ill.
19 (1949) Archie Manning, Cleveland, Miss.
19 (1967) John Friesz, Missoula, Mont.
20 (1867) Andy Wyant, Chicago, Ill.
20 (1920) Al Sparlis, Los Angeles, Calif.
20 (1924) Herman Wedemeyer, Honolulu, Hawai’i
21 (1923) Ara Parseghian, Akron, Ohio
21 (1940) James Saxton, College Station, Texas
21 (1943) Johnny Roland, Corpus Christi, Texas
21 (1943) Glenn Ressler, Dornsife, Pa.
21 (1958) Jim Ritcher, Berea, Ohio
21-(d – 2011) Joe Steffy, Newburgh, N.Y.
22 (1907) Paul Schwegler, Raymond, Wash.
22 (1960) Dave Rimington, Omaha, Neb.
22-(d – 2002) Paul Giel, Minneapolis, Minn.
23 (1888) Ted Coy, Andover, Mass.
23-(d - 1938) George Sanford, New York, N.Y.
24 (1894) Harry Baujan, Beardstown, Ill.
24-(d – 2002) Creighton Miller, Shaker Heights, Ohio
25 (1927) Calvin Roberts, Hector, Minn.
26 (1887) Ed Hart, Exeter, N.H.
26 (1895) Ira Rodgers, Bethany, W.Va.
26 (1902) Bernie Shively, Oliver, Ill.
26 (1939) Herb Deromedi, Royal Oak, Mich.

The College Football Historian-21-
26-(d – 1965) Homer Norton, College Station, Texas
26-(d – 1994) Pug Lund, Minneapolis, Minn.
27 (1889) George Little, Leominster, Pa.
27 (1960) Randy Trautman, Caldwell, Idaho
27-(d – 1932) Bill Morley, Pasadena, Calif.
28 (1888) Jim Thorpe, Prague, Okla.
28 (1948) Bruce Taylor, Perth Amboy, N.J.
28-(d – 1964) Barton “Botchey” Koch, Temple, Texas
28-(d – 1979) Lou Little, Delray Beach, Fla.
29 (1892) Earl Abell, Portage, Wis.
29 (1949) Rex Kern, Lancaster, Ohio
30 (1891) Bob Peck, Lock Haven, Pa.
30 (1915) Larry Kelly, Conneaut, Ohio
30 (1941) Charlie Richard, Grain Valley, Mo.
30 (1949) Lydell Mitchell, Salem, N.J.
31 (1953) Richard Wood, Elizabeth, N.J.
31 (1967) Kevin Dent, Vicksburg, Miss.
Bob Verduzco is a California boy who graduated from an Ivy League school. So how did he end up in Michigan teaching high school math?

Verduzco grew up in Southern California. In the summer prior to his freshman year, he spent a lot of time working on his quarterbacking skills with his uncle, Mario Verduzco, who was a high school football coach. Thanks to his hard work, he made the varsity football team at Aptos High School as a backup quarterback in his freshman year.

Four games into the season, the starting quarterback broke his leg. Verduzco took over and led the team to the playoffs. In the league championship game he beat his Uncle Mario’s team, Soquel High School from Santa Cruz. Mario was the Soquel defensive coordinator.

He switched schools in his sophomore year and transferred to Soquel High School where he played for the next three years.

In the late fall of his senior season, he came home from school one day to find a Yale assistant coach waiting in his living room to talk to him. He didn't even know where Yale was, other than it was somewhere out east. Verduzco was also recruited by West Point, Boston College, Clemson, the University of
Verduzco entered Yale in the fall of 1986 and played football on the freshman team. The following year, as a sophomore, he was one of eight quarterbacks on the varsity team. At five feet, eleven inches tall and 185 pounds, he beat out six of them to become the Yale backup quarterback that year.

In 1988, his junior year, he was named the Yale starter. Late in the first half of the season opener against Brown University, Verduzco was hit in the knee while throwing a pass and tore his ACL and MCL. All of his knee cartilage had also been crushed. Unaware of just how seriously his knee had been injured, he returned in the second half and finished the game, where he threw for 150 yards and a touchdown. The game ended in a tie because there was no overtime in the Ivy League at that time. He was named the Offensive Player of the Game. The next day, an MRI revealed just how serious his injury was.

Thanks to a family friend back in Santa Cruz, who was a physical therapist, Verduzco was put in contact with the team surgeon of the NFL San Francisco 49ers, who agreed to perform reconstructive surgery.

Verduzco flew back to California and had the surgery performed on his injured knee. His rehab was long and painful. In fact, a second operation had to be performed when his recovery did not go as planned. After an entire year of rehabilitation, Verduzco was finally cleared to return to the practice field.

He missed the remainder of his junior season and all of his senior season as well. He finally got to play again in the fifth year of his college eligibility under NCAA rules in 1990.
He graduated from Yale in the spring of 1991 with a degree in Economics. After a year in the business world, the desire to coach football got to him. In 1993, Verduzco returned to Yale and was the quarterbacks coach for a season.

From 1995-2000, he was an assistant coach at De Anza Community College in San Jose under his Uncle Mario, who was the head coach there at the time. Verduzco coached the quarterbacks and wide receivers.

Ever since he was a junior at Yale, Verduzco has wanted to be a high school math teacher. Two of his brothers live in Michigan so Verduzco and his wife and family eventually moved to the Southwest Michigan area. He got this teaching certificate online and did his student teaching at Vicksburg High School in Vicksburg, Michigan. He was also the quarterback coach of the Vicksburg varsity football team in 2005.

He has also spent time teaching and/or coaching at Hackett Catholic Central High school in Kalamazoo and was also the head football coach of the freshman team at Portage Northern High School for one season.

"I think people have to do what they're cut out to do and to follow that calling," Verduzco said. "If you're happy, you'll be successful."

Since 2008, he has been teaching math at Galesburg-Augusta High School in Galesburg, Michigan. He mainly teaches Algebra I, but has also taught Geometry.

This coming fall, Verduzco will be the offensive coordinator of the Galesburg varsity football team under new G-A football head coach Tony Smith. Verduzco will be calling the plays.
Recently, Smith and Verduzco visited with legendary G-A High School football coach Bill Maskill who still lives in the Galesburg area. Maskill was the head football coach at Galesburg for 40 years (1951-1991). When he retired, his record was 273-84-2 and he led the Rams to four state titles. Smith and Verduzco are taking over a team that has won only one game in the last four years and has not won a game in the past three years. Their visit to Coach Maskill was an opportunity to get the former G-A coach’s views on what it will take to return Galesburg to a winning tradition.

"I'm looking forward to the opportunity to coach at Galesburg," said Verduzco. "Coach Smith has allowed me to create the offense based on some of the things I've done while coaching at the high school level and at Yale."

Verduzco has come a long way from his days as an Ivy League quarterback and student in the late 1980's. But teaching math and coaching football at a small Class C high school in Southwest Michigan is right where he wants to be at this time in his life.

- Foot notes to **The Gridiron Crisis of 1905: Was It Really A Crisis?**

*By John Sayle Watterson*

---

2. Cincinnati *Commercial Tribune*, 3 Dec. 1905. The article listed all of the casualties—including the trainer of the Northwestern team, who drowned at preseason practice in Wisconsin.


